

Lincoln Douglas Case Outline

Opening Quotation:

Find a quote that fits your value or the topic.

“Because I agree with ___ (author of the quote) ___, I affirm/negate the resolution which states, Resolved:...”

***Write the resolution word for word.*

Definitions:

Define the terms in the resolution.

Value and Criterion:

“My value for this round will be _____, which is important because...This value relates to the resolution because...”

“My criterion will be _____. This criterion is important because...This criterion achieves my value premise because...”

“Contention One:...” *Write one of the reasons you support or negate the resolution.*

“Subpoint A:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Subpoint B:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Contention Two:...” *Write another one of the reasons you support or negate the resolution.*

“Subpoint A:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Subpoint B:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Contention Three:...” *Write another one of the reasons you support or negate the resolution.*

“Subpoint A:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Subpoint B:...”**Claim-Why or How does that reason support or negate.**

Warrant-Explain your claim.

Evidence-Put your cut card here with complete source.

Impact-Why is this important or what impact does it have.

Link-Explain how does this claim relate to the criterion and value.

“Education is not the filling of a pail, but the lighting of a fire.” An interpretation of this quote by William Butler Yeats (yates), illustrates that the purpose of education is not to “fill up” a child with knowledge, information and skills, but instead to give them the inspiration and tools to be able to learn that knowledge, information and skills well beyond the classroom setting. Education is about learning not knowledge. It is unreasonable to expect that the knowledge students have learned by high school graduation is adequate for what is needed for a successful future. Education should not consist of cramming as much information into a student and possibly leading them to despise school, but it should offer youth the desire to learn, and furnish those tools so that they can continue learning throughout the rest of their lives. Because I agree with Yeats (“yates”), I stand firmly for the resolution: *Public high school students in the United States ought not be required to pass standardized exit exams to graduate.*

Definitions are available on request:

“Ought Not”: *The opposite of Ought: Used to indicate obligation or duty (“ought.” The American Heritage® Dictionary of the English Language, Fourth Edition. Houghton Mifflin Company, 2004. 05 Oct. 2009. <Dictionary.com http://dictionary.reference.com/browse/ought)*

“Standardized Exit Exams to Graduate”: *Though they vary from state to state, the exams test for basic proficiency in math, English, and writing. If students fail the exam, they don't graduate-regardless of their grades. (Weekly Reader Corp, Final exit? Exit exams put students to the test, April 21, 2006, Online:Internet, http://findarticles.com/p/articles/mi_m0EPF/is_24_105/ai_n16133405/, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009)*

Public Education in the United States: *programs of instruction offered to children, adolescents, and adults in the United States through schools and colleges operated by state and local governments. Unlike the nationally regulated and financed education systems of many other industrialized societies, American public education is primarily the responsibility of the states and individual school districts. (Encarta Encyclopedia, 2009):*

(The resolution does not specify any particular type of standardized exit examination – only that the tests are standardized and passing the test is a condition for graduating from U.S. public high schools.

The value I offer in today debate is that of **education**. A recent analysis of the topic states “There is ample evidence to suggest that America’s educational approach using a liberal arts, science, and critical thinking-based curriculum supplemented by a diversity of extracurricular activities such as athletics, arts, leadership and student government, and public service helped train entire generations of socially-aware, articulate, hard-working, and politically active citizens who were articulate, adaptable, and educated. These broadly-educated Americans were able to not only adapt to the vast social changes and upheavals throughout the 20th century, but thrive and adapt to the rise and fall of industries and embrace and benefit from the emergence of new technologies.” (Minh A. Luong & Company Tutorial, September-October 2009 National Forensic League Lincoln-Douglas Topic, Online:Database, PlanetDebate.com, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009)

According to the Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy,

~~For one thing, it is obvious that~~ children are born illiterate and innumerate, and ignorant of the norms and cultural achievements of the community or society into which they have been thrust; but with the help of professional teachers ~~and the dedicated amateurs in their families and immediate environs (and with the aid, too, of educational resources made available through the media and nowadays the internet),~~ within a few years they can read, write, calculate, and act ~~(at least often)~~ in culturally-appropriate ways. Some learn these skills with more facility than others, and so education also serves as a social-sorting mechanism and undoubtedly has enormous impact on the economic fate of the individual. ~~Put more abstractly,~~ At its best education equips individuals with the skills and substantive knowledge that allows them to define and to pursue their own goals, and also allows them to participate in the life of their community as full-fledged, autonomous citizens.

~~The issue of what should be taught to students at all levels of education—the issue of curriculum content—obviously is a fundamental one, and it is an extraordinarily difficult one with which to grapple. In tackling it, care needs to be taken to distinguish between education and schooling—for although education can occur in schools, so can mis-education (as Dewey pointed out), and many other things can take place there that are educationally~~

orthogonal (such as the provision of free or subsidized lunches, or the development of social networks); and it also must be recognized that education can occur in the home, in libraries and museums, in churches and clubs, in solitary interaction with the public media, and the like. (Phillips, D.C., "Philosophy of Education", The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy (Spring 2009 Edition), Edward N. Zalta (ed.), URL=<http://plato.stanford.edu/archives/spr2009/entries/education-philosophy/>). Online: Internet, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009.)

The criterion I offer is that of **authentic learning**. According to Rockman et al, a company specializing in educational issues, "Authentic learning is an approach to teaching and learning that has students working on realistic problems, to gain new knowledge and skills in context, rather than listening to lectures and memorizing vast amounts of information to be reproduced on tests. Students construct their own meanings from their work and produce products and performances that have value or meaning beyond success in school.

Authentic learning promotes higher-order thinking and the integration of knowledge rather than strict subject area constraints. It rewards depth of knowledge rather than surface knowledge. And it encourages students, working alone or in a collegial team, to build on ideas connected to the real world.

(Rockman et al, (a research, evaluation, and consulting company that specializes in examining critical issues in formal and informal education), Authentic Learning & Technology, Online: Internet, <http://www.rockman.com/articles/AuthenticLearning.htm>, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009)

Contention I: Standardized Exit Exams Do Not Value Education.

Authentic learning is the way to show that education is valued for all American public high school students, but the nature and style of standardized test does not allow for evaluating authentic learning. "Since nearly all of the state graduation tests are multiple-choice or short answer type examinations, higher-level and critical thinking type learning are not assessed. Successful test takers will be rewarded for memorization of fact patterns and formulae – exactly the type of memorization-regurgitation type learning that pays little dividends after graduation. (Minh A. Luong & Company Tutorial, September-October 2009 National Forensic League Lincoln-Douglas Topic, Online:Database, PlanetDebate.com, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009)

Subpoint A: STANDARDIZED TESTS DO NOT MEASURE USEFUL KNOWLEDGE.

James McMillan, "High Stakes Testing", Commonwealth Educational Policy Institute, http://www.cepi.vcu.edu/policy_issues/saa/high_stakes.html,

Objective assessments measure too much simple knowledge. Objectively scored tests, such as the multiple-choice tests used extensively in Virginia, are best used to measure student knowledge and simple skills. These kinds of tests are not the best way to measure deep understanding, complex skills, reasoning, problem-solving, and critical thinking.

Subpoint B: EXIT EXAMS ONLY MEASURE A SMALL SKILL SET.

James McMillan, "High Stakes Testing", Commonwealth Educational Policy Institute, http://www.cepi.vcu.edu/policy_issues/saa/high_stakes.html

What you test and how you test it is what you get; what is not tested you do not get. A potentially serious limitation with high stakes tests is not what they do, it is what they do not do. High stakes assessments inform us about only some of what is important in public education, namely student proficiency on what is tested. The tests are limited by what content is covered and by the nature of the assessments. There is much that is not covered by the tests that is also very important to knowing whether students have had a high quality education and have developed needed skills.

Contention II: Standardized Exit Exams Are High Stake And Devalue Education

S. E. Smith describes high stakes examinations as: When the outcome of a standardized test is used as the sole determining factor for making a major decision, it is known as high-stakes testing. Common examples of high-stakes testing in the United States include standardized tests administered to measure school progress under No Child Left Behind (NCLB), high school exit exams, and the use of test scores to determine whether or not a school will retain accreditation.

(S. E. Smith, What is High-Stakes Testing?, 2009. At URL: <http://www.wisegeek.com/what-is-high-stakes-testing.htm>, Minh A. Luong & Company Tutorial, September-October 2009 National Forensic League Lincoln-Douglas Topic, Online:Database, PlanetDebate.com, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009)

Subpoint A: EXIT EXAMS NARROW STATE CURRICULUM.

James McMillan, "High Stakes Testing", Commonwealth Educational Policy Institute,
http://www.cepi.vcu.edu/policy_issues/saa/high_stakes.html

Statewide assessment leads to a more narrow statewide curriculum. Because of high stakes, schools will narrow the curriculum to emphasize what is on the test. The common test for all schools drives a common curriculum, resulting in less local autonomy and less curriculum that is tailored to local conditions, traditions, and context.

Subpoint B: HAVING ONE NARROW MEASURE OF GRADUATION WORTHINESS IS BAD

Deborah; Senior Editor; The Perils of High School Exit Exams; Educational Leadership; November 2005; page 90

Professional testing experts warn against relying on any one test as the sole source of information for important education decisions. No test, they say, can be reliable and valid enough to fulfill such a role. Fortunately, only a handful of states currently require students to pass exit examinations to receive a high school diploma without offering students any other options or alternatives to demonstrate their learning. In fact, more than half of the 25 states with high school exit examinations either have developed or are in the process of developing systems that rely on multiple measures of performance as the basis for graduation. Such measures include portfolios, performance assessments, grades in courses tied to state standards, and student exhibitions of learning. NCES data indicate that, in contrast to the decreasing graduation rates in states with tests only graduation systems, states that introduced multiple measures assessment systems in the 1990s tend to maintain higher and steadier rates of graduation.

Subpoint C: STANDARDIZED EXIT EXAMS LEAD TO REDUCTIONS OF ELECTIVES AND THE ARTS

"Student-Achievement Testing." Issues & Controversies On File: n. pag. Issues & Controversies. Facts On File News Services, 13 Oct. 2000, Online: Database, <http://www.2facts.com/article/i0502310>, Retrieved on Oct. 5, 2009

Some schools have reduced or eliminated important activities not covered by the tests, such as physical education, fine arts and projects for science fairs, critics say. In Tallahassee, Fla., for example, school officials have reduced class time spent on projects for history and science fairs in order to devote more time to test preparation. Those cutbacks are an unintended, yet unavoidable, consequence of standardized testing, critics contend. "The subjects and activities of a general school experience...in many of our schools is being diminished or eliminated," says David Clark, a spokesman for the Florida affiliate of the National Education Association, a teachers' union.

I am now open for cross examination.